Libraries for Development Project

Finnish Library Association, Namibia Library and Archives Services and Tanzania Library Services Board

With the Financial Support of Government of Finland

Prepared by

 Prof Kingo Mchombu – University of Namibia

10th March, 2015

Table of Contents

Acronym and Abbreviations

HIV and AIDS Human Immunodeficiency virus and Acquired Immune deficiency syndrome

IFLA   International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions

ICT   Information and Communication Technology

NGO   Non-Government Organisations

NLAS   Namibia Library and Archives Services

SLADS   School of Library, Archives and Documentation Services (Bagamoyo)

SMEs   Small and Medium Enterprises

TLSB   Tanzania Library Services Board

UNAM   University of Namibia

UNESCO   United Nations Education and Cultural Organisation

ABSTRACT

In developing countries information and communication technology can help in efforts to alleviate poverty by providing access to appropriate information on education, agriculture, SMEs, health and good governance. However access to ICTs for poor communities in Africa is hampered by lack of resources, absence of ICT skills, and absence of policies in public libraries and other technology providers which prioritise free ICT access for poor communities. This report presents findings from an evaluation study of a project implemented by Namibia Library and Archives Services (NLAS), Tanzania Library Services Board (TLSB) and Finnish Library Association funded by the Finnish Government. The broad objectives of the project were: to create a sustainable model for ICT access through community/public libraries; to build capacity of library personnel through training in ICT skills; to empower library personnel to teach basic ICT skills to community members and NGOs and to raise awareness of decision makers on the role of public libraries in supporting national development goals. The report presents participants views on the impact of the ICT training and access to the Internet in their lives, successes of the project as well as aspects which were less successful. The report makes some recommendations on the creation of a sustainable model for ICT access through public libraries for both NLAS and TLSB.

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The evaluation was conducted during the period of June-July 2014 in Namibia and October, 2014 in Tanzania. The researcher used library science students from University of Namibia (UNAM) and School of Library, Archives and Documentation Studies (SLADS), Bagamoyo, Tanzania as research assistants.

2.1 Purpose of Library for Development Project
The broad objective of the project was to promote the knowledge based society and public use of information communication technology at libraries in Namibia and Tanzania. The public library services of Namibia and Tanzania worked closely with the Finnish Library Association and funding was provided by the Government of Finland, and the two countries involved.

2.2 Key findings
Data gathered from Annual Reports indicate that the figures that were planned to be achieved by the project (provided in brackets) were met and in many cases surpassed. NLAS trained 153 library staff members to provide ICT training to community and NGO members. TLSB also had trained 163 library staff members for a similar purpose. Community members trained in both countries were 3315 and 1073 for NLAS and TLSB respectively. ICT training for NGOs and other groups were 1044 and 871 for TLSB and NLAS respectively. The figures were more than the targets envisaged in the original project proposal. The majority of the community members who received ICT training were women.

The course was perceived as helpful by most of the respondents (82% and 63% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). Additional topics which respondents wanted more training on were Internet searching (23% and 61% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). Interestingly, these same topics were the most liked by both sets of respondents.

Respondents who perceived they had received adequate basic ICT training were 49% and 44% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively. When queried if they had done any **improvements to their SMEs** as a result of the ICT training, the responses were similar from the two groups of respondents. In both Namibia and Tanzania those who said yes were 24% and 27% respectively. The majority had not done any improvements yet, perhaps given the short time they had after training. Queried whether they had searched for **education information** over the Internet after training, the respondents who said yes were relatively high for both Namibia and Tanzania (54% for both countries). In the case of health information searching, 39% and 24% of respondents had used the Internet to search for **health information** in Namibia and Tanzania respectively, while print sources had been used by 10% and 29% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively. Respondents who had used the Internet to search for governance and civic information were higher in Tanzania than in Namibia (14% and 53% respectively).

Reported perceived changes among respondents were mainly in the area of being able to type their own documents **using Microsoft Word** (75% and 68% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively); conducting own **Internet search** (44% and 52% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively); email use (34% and 19% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). **Views towards the public library** had become more positive for most respondents (90% and 82% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). **First time internet use** was at the public library for most respondents in Namibia (51%) while in Tanzania it was at home (31%), but **after ICT training** there was an increase in use of the Internet services of the public library for both countries (57% and 41% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

The **second part of the evaluation** focussed on **library staff members** who were trained as part of the capacity building component of the project. Below is a brief report of the findings of the evaluation on the ICT training of library staff members.

A total of 13 and 49 staff members responded to the questionnaire in Namibia and Tanzania respectively. Out of the respondents, most were females (85% and 82% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). The level of education of most respondents varied between the two countries. In Namibia most respondents were between 25 and 34 years old (69%) while those above 50 were very few (8%). In Tanzania, most respondents were 25-34 years and above 50 years old (37% in each group). Two of the biggest groups in Namibia had secondary school and tertiary education (46% and 38% respectively). Similarly, in Tanzania, the biggest group had tertiary education followed by secondary education (61% and 29% respectively).

Staff qualification showed a divergent pattern, in Namibia most staff had a Bachelor of library science (31%) while other qualification was indicated by 46%. In Tanzania, most staff indicated they had a Diploma in library science (33%), while a fairly high group indicated other qualifications (39%).

Use of computers before and after training
Respondents who indicated very little or no **prior use of computers before** ICT training were quite high in both countries (23% and 49% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). Respondent who said they used computers daily were higher in Namibia than Tanzania (62% and 41% respectively). The feelings after ICT training were that many respondents felt they needed more training (31% and 41% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

Respondents were asked to rate the ICT course with regard to helpfulness of the ICT training, and most respondents said they found the ICT course helpful/very helpful (92% and 98% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). The main **impact on the lives** of respondents was in the acquisition of basic ICT skills (92% and 100% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). The **better performance at work** was reported as one of the results from the ICT training (92% and 96% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively).
There was a contrast in the use of the **Internet to provide information** to users with Namibian respondents reporting higher usage than their Tanzanian counterparts (100% and 63% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). The reported **extent of use of the internet for self-development** shows that Namibia respondents had more usage than their Tanzania counterparts (92% and 62% respectively). When asked whether use of the **Internet had increased** after the ICT training, most respondents in Namibia responded there was an increase (85%) while fewer of their Tanzania counterparts experienced a similar increase in internet use (53%). There was comparatively lower use of the Internet to **further tertiary education** in both countries (38% and 31% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). Asked about the **level of complexity of the course materials** given out in the course, most respondents found the materials 'just right' (62% and 63% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively), while some found the materials were too low (31% and 26% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

6. Recommendations
The findings of the evaluation indicate this pioneering project had achieved most of the goals it was set out to achieve, largely due to the dedication of a committed project team in Finland, Namibia and Tanzania. From the responses and document review, however, we would like to make the following recommendations for the future.

6.1 General recommendations

1. It was apparent from the responses that community members and NGOs members as well as many of the library staff have learnt the basics of ICT but they need to develop the necessary confidence for future training programmes. We therefore recommend that more ICT training be provided to both library staff as well as community members on the areas they found they still have some difficulties.

2. The use of the Internet is catching on very well given the short span of time the project has been in existence. We would like to recommend that in order to increase the level of use there is need to work with relevant Government Ministries, NGOs, and International agencies to harvest content and create repositories of the content so that community members and NGOs members can access relevant information. I would recommend use of one of the open source software such as D-Space for the purpose of creating a repository of relevant digital documents with appropriate partners in each country. The document repository should focus on health, agriculture, SMEs and education, which were the subject areas of focus of the Library for Development project.

3. The project was designed with a strong component of networking with NGO's and relevant stakeholders to strengthen and enrich the range of activities. We would like to recommend that this aspect be strengthened in future by forming a project advisory committee which includes these external stakeholders where/if they are prepared to work with the NLAS and TLSB to achieve the worthy goals of this project.

4. The capacity building of library staff was an excellent way to prepare them to provide ICT training to community and NGO members. We would like to recommend that in the next round of training a subject of training-of-trainers be included so staff can acquire basic methodologies on how to train adults.

5. The library for development project had as its main goal the provision of ICT literacy skills which is a valuable tool for ushering in the knowledge society. We would, however, recommend that NLAS, TLSB and FLA consider expanding this goal to incorporate digital literacy skills so that each year, they would work with volunteers from the local Library Associations and library staff to provide digital literacy training on the use of ICTs including mobile phones for internet searching and digital resources. The broader approach could open the door for broader collaboration with mobile phone operators, Banks, and Ministries of ICTs and Education who might be persuaded to provide more resources for the rolling out of this exciting project.

6.2 Recommendations specific to TLSB

The above general recommendations are aimed at all the three institutions involved in this project. We would like to make specific recommendations in the case of TLSB to address some of the challenges which were specific to their situation and context with regard to this project.

1. It would seem there were many library staff who were not directly involved with user services who also benefitted from the ICT training. However, such training, valuable as it is, may not have a direct impact on the project outcomes. It is recommended that the ICT training be restricted to library staff serving users directly to achieve project outcomes.

2. The lack of ICT training facilities was one of the challenges community members and NGO members faced during training. We would like to recommend that a dedicated ICT training room be set aside at TLSB, particularly at Regional Libraries such as Morogoro Library, for the training of community and NGO members.

3. The shortage of computers at TLSB and free Internet access was a major issue raised during the evaluation, including the problem of frequent power cuts. We recommend, therefore, the possibility of more computers during the 2nd phase and active engagement with relevant Government Ministries in Tanzania on the possibility of providing free Internet access to the public through TLSB branches nation-wide.

END OF EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

3. MAIN REPORT

1.1 The long-term development objective of the Project

The broad objective was to promote the knowledge based society and public use of information technology at libraries in Namibia and Tanzania, so as to render better services to the residents of the recipient countries.

By supporting the knowledge based society, the Project also addressed a number of other issues, e.g. bridging the digital divide, improving living conditions of people, supporting education, including literacy, and promoting the skills of the civic society.

Extending the services of the knowledge based society to groups of women would improve their skills in supporting education, and literacy. The most vulnerable groups of people (unemployed youth, subsistence farmers, new literates) who have difficulties in accessing ICT services will now have a **free access to them**. Information on HIV / AIDS and other diseases as well as preventive health methods, made available at the libraries and disseminated to the public, will add knowledge about the health issues.

The above goals are in unison of the development goals of the recipient countries which are explained in Namibia's Vision 2013 and Tanzania's Vision 2015.

1.2 The direct objective of the Project

- To create a sustainable model for ICT access through community / public libraries and ICT instructors training the library personnel in IT matters and information search in Namibia and Tanzania

- To build capacity of NLAS and TLSB by training library personnel in ICT skills.

- To make the library personnel able to teach basic ICT skills and information search to individual customers as well as to members of various NGO´s (e.g. women, entrepreneurs, unemployed and out of school youth, new literates and those needing information on HIV/AIDS and other health issues) both in Namibia and Tanzania.

- To involve decision makers both in Namibia and Tanzania to raise their awareness of the role of libraries in supporting national development goals.

4. LITERATURE REVIEW
1 Introduction
The literature review was guided by the long term goals and objectives of the *Library for Development Project*. The broad objective was to promote the knowledge based society through free public access to ICTs which would lead to a better information services to bridge the digital divide, improve living conditions, support education and literacy, promote skills for governance and civic society skills. Additionally, the project was broadly aimed at women and disadvantaged groups in society who are often marginalized by ICT related projects (Library for Development Project, 2012).

Beyond Access Report (2012) points out that in the information age, internet access has become crucial for accessing essential public services, health information, education and financial services. The report concludes that it is therefore vital that governments particularly in developing countries take action and implement plans to provide internet access to the nearly two-thirds of the world's population that is currently unconnected.

2. Types of Users of ICT in public access venues

Several writers have written on the pattern of users and usage of public access ICT centres. Etta & Parvyn-Wamahiu (2003) have concluded that there were low levels of use because of failure of public access venues to make their service relevant to the community. Other writers have focused on types of users and concluded that in comparison with the general population, the primary users of public access venues are young, male, relatively well-educated, of relatively higher socio-economic status and usually those who have had prior usually had prior access to the Internet at some other location (Amariles, Paz, Russell, and Johnson, 2006; Chisenga, 2004). Also identified as high users of these venues were students (high school and college). The overall trend as noted by several writers is the importance of public access venues to middle class society (Haseloff, 2005).

An evaluation of the Biblioredes program in Chile found a marked reduction in the proportion of users accessing the Internet for surfing, chatting and other recreational goals between 2003 and 2005. The authors conclude that activities had shifted to education and communication (Román and Guerrero, 2005). While Proenza's (2008) survey of telecentre users in Sri Lanka revealed a youth profile, he also found a higher proportion of female users.

The dominant finding here is that public access venues are used primarily to meet personal and social needs such as communicating with friends and family, entertainment, doing homework, and developing computer skills (Etta and Parvyn-Wamahiu, 2003; Eve and Brophy, 2001; Gitta and Ikoja-Odongo, 2003; Haseloff, 2005; Mercer, 2006; Pal, Nedevschi, Patra, and Brewer, 2005).

The conclusion from these authors is that economic, political and other such services are only patronized by few users. There was high demand for services such as email, internet

browsing and computer training (Etta and Parvyn-Wamahiu, 2003; Eve and Brophy, 2001; Gitta and Ikoja-Odongo, 2003)

3. Knowledge society and ICTs

There is wide acknowledgement that information and communication technologies (particularly computers and the Internet) are important resources for socio-economic advancement in both developed and developing countries. This is particularly important as we enter into a global economy, driven by the "information age" (Sey and Fellows, 2009).

Both UNESCO and the World Bank have championed the importance of the knowledge society, although putting their emphasis on slightly different aspects. UNESCO has asserted that knowledge societies are about "capabilities to identify, produce, process, transform, disseminate and use information to build and apply knowledge for human development" UNESCO (2005: 27). UNESCO has sought to build equitable, open and participatory knowledge societies, which rests on four principles, namely: universal access to information in the public domain, freedom of expression, equal access to education, and respect for cultural and linguistic diversity UNESCO, 2005). In contrast to UNESCO, the World Bank has proposed the creation of a knowledge economy which rests on the following four pillars:

1. Information communication technologies (ICTs) for efficient communication, dissemination and processing of information.
2. An educated and skilled population that has the capacity to create share and use knowledge.
3. An economy that provides incentives for the efficient use of existing and new knowledge and allows entrepreneurship to flourish.
4. An efficient innovation system consisting of relevant institutions such as small and medium business enterprises, research centres, universities, and other organisations that can access and make use of the global knowledge base assimilate and adapt it to local conditions and needs and create new technologies. The two approaches are not too far apart, as they would seem, and they complement each other as they support each other in respect to access to information, educational opportunities, production of local content, and global and local knowledge sharing using ICTs and other means (Ponelis and Holmner (2015).

The African continent and other developing countries lag behind in the use of ICTs to achieve development goals in the context of knowledge societies and knowledge economy. However, Ponelis and Holmner (2015:2) have observed that many African countries aspire to become information societies and eventually knowledge societies and participate as equal partners in the global economy and many countries have initiated projects to address the low level of connectivity and access to the Internet (Holmner and Britz, 2013).

African countries however face major challenges in their ability to use ICTs for economic growth. According to *The World in 2014: ICTs Facts and Figures,* Africa has an estimated 69% of mobile cellphone penetration by 2014. The report also states that 20%

of Africans are using the internet, 11% of households in Africa have Internet access, and the comparable figure for Europe is 75% for households with Internet access (ITU, 2015).

4. Education and literacy

Quareshi (2014) has observed that among the factors which make ICTs effective in development is their use in education and skills development. Such education and skills development can allow people to learn new production techniques, access market resources and keep in contact with peers and associates for learning purposes (May, 2012). Other reports have highlighted the importance of IT training services to obtain ICT literacy for populations without such skills which is critical for them to use ICTs (Román and Guerrero, 2005). However, there have also been reports that users can teach each other and systematic ICT training is not necessary. One study demonstrated that computer literacy can be achieved without formal training (Dangwal, Jha, Chatterjee, and Mitra, 2005). The above study, known as the hole-in-the-wall computer, showed that marginalized children in India had the ability to teach themselves and learn from each other computer skills. However, this experiment has not been repeated elsewhere to make it the norm rather than the exception, hence ICT literacy still largely requires some form of training, particularly for community members.

5. Agriculture and livestock husbandry

There have been several studies which analysed the ICT usage by researchers and extension services in agriculture, including Kalusopa (2005) and Kumar (2005). Most of these studies found there was effective information communication to highly educated groups in society such as agricultural researchers and extension workers. The studies also found challenges in the implementation of ICT initiatives including lack of proper policies, high telecommunication costs, gender bias, urban bias, and poor telecommunication and electricity infrastructure. For ordinary farmer's mobile phones were found to be most effective for communication of agricultural information (May, 2012). On the other hand, Heeks (2014) concluded that there is need to provide access in rural areas and for the marginalized groups to further the goals of a knowledge society and knowledge economy in African countries and counter social exclusion.

5. Income generation and employment Opportunities

Most of the literature reviewed suggests the impact of ICTs on income generation and employment creation is an important area although not always easy to prove as it takes time. Kolko et al (2007) reported that about 15% of ICT users surveyed had acquired a job as a result of the skills they gained at the computer centre. Additionally, some users created new businesses, while those who were already businesses owners said use of the ICT brought direct benefits to their business. In addition, Ulrich's (2004) respondents reported a variety of economic benefits from public access use – improved farming practices (86% of respondents), better price information (62%), business contacts (28%), and found work (19%). McClure et al (2000) found perceptions of improved financial wellbeing (personal and business) as a result of access to financial, business and job-related information; career support; technology training and other IT resources. Likewise, Fedotova (2008) found that 89% of participants in a job skills training course

believed that the IT skills they had acquired would help in their job search, and 94% felt it would help them to gain a promotion. An assessment of UNESCO's community multimedia centres also identified a range of economic and social benefits from creation of new livelihood opportunities to the removal of social barriers (Creech, 2004). While some researchers have found limited evidence of employment-related benefits (Lengyel et al., 2006; Mercer, 2006)

On the other hand, in a study assessing the impact of a telecentres in Colombia, Parkinson and Lauzon (2008) found that just about 15% of telecentre users used it for business purposes, and few unemployed users used public access internet in their job searches. In fact, most considered it inappropriate for that use (Parkinson and Ramirez, 2007). Furthermore, self-employed people rarely used the internet in support of their business needs.

6. Health services
A study on a tele-centre project in Bangladesh found that through public access to ICTs, community members gained knowledge on basic hygiene practices (Ashraf, 2008).
Beyond Access (2012) describes a case study of Uganda's Hoima Public Library which provides free internet access and training for health workers and the general public. The purpose of the initiative was to improve community health through the ICT programme. It is however important to note that the ICT initiative was combined with a series of public lectures and films, yielded significant results: just two years after the service launched, a survey found that over 38 percent more youth, 39 percent more men and 29 percent more women were using the library to seek health information. It is significance perhaps lies in the mixing of ICT technologies with traditional ways of communication which are more interactive.

7. Governance and civic engagement
Kumar and Best (2006) have found that the availability of e-government services at public access facilities is positively associated with use of certain services. Use of these services leads to lower levels of corruption in service CIS Literature Review on the Impact of Public Access to ICT delivery (Rajendra Kumar and Best, 2006). In the above study the researchers found increased use of birth certificate and old age pension services when residents became aware of the lower cost involved in accessing them at the internet kiosk, including people who would otherwise not have availed themselves of the service through the traditional means. Looking at public libraries in the US, Bertot, Jaeger, Langa, and McClure, (2006) concluded that library internet services played an important role in the providing access to government services. Although the case of an example of public libraries in the US might not be relevant as it is a highly developed country, the examples from the Indian subcontinent hold more promise for public libraries in Namibia and Tanzania.

8. Capacity building
Librarians also called infomediaries and/or local champions (formal and informal) have been found to be important contributors to the viability and sustainability of ICT public access venues, more especially in the case of libraries, and have helped to attract users to

the site (Kumar and Best, 2006), by providing guidance and guiding users unfamiliar with ICTs (Bailey, 2009; Kiri and Menon, 2006; Rajalekshmi, 2007; Ulrich, 2004). For example, (McClure, Fraser, Nelson, and Robbins, 2000) found that one result of ICT services in libraries was that library staff gained recognition as important community resources. A related issue is that of trust – according to Rajalekshmi (2007), trust between citizens and intermediaries at various levels affects the way e-governance services are accessed and used.

Another way in which public access to ICTs have been found to benefit institutions is by improving the organisational capacity of the telecentre host – a result of their access to ICTs, IT training, and resultant changes in working practices: Amariles et al (2006) found that these impacts were more notable than community and user impacts, leading them to propose that it may be advisable to think of public access ICT impacts in terms of their potential to strengthen local institutions as against the tendency to focus on micro level end-user benefits.

Other studies show that an outcome of ICT service provision in libraries was that people began to see libraries as an important aspect of quality of life in their community, and that there was an increase in positive attitudes towards public access ICT venues (Bertot, McClure and Ryan, 1999; McClure et al, 2000). Other writers conclude that community status was enhanced due to the presence of ICT facilities in public libraries (Eve and Brophy, 2001; Mercer, 2006; Sheppard, 2001).

Sharma, Sharma and Subhedar (2008) investigated the impact of a community multimedia centre training programme and identified increased computer skills, income and confidence as primary benefits accruing to female participants. Similarly, Amariles et al (2006) concluded that a telecentre program had enabled women to play a more active social and political role in a library for development project in their community.

Beyond Access (2012) present a case study of ICT literacy training and capacity building of the public libraries which has helped Chileans to acquire ICT literacy which in turn has led to the launch of businesses, access to market information and developing technology skills to improve their job competitiveness. At the time of writing (2012) the BiblioRedes public library network alone had delivered more than 10 million internet and computer workshops, and had helped participants create more than six thousand local content websites.

9. Local content

Although it is widely believed that local content and services can increase ICT usage and diffusion (Kumar and Best, 2006), the results of some studies show that demand for communication services overshadows local content specific services, especially among marginalized communities (Pal, 2005; Haseloff, 2005). Part of the solution to local content creation is through mixing of new and old technologies whereby, for example, at Uganda's Hoima public library public lectures, films and video shows, and talks by extension workers (agriculture and health) are given to support the ICT access initiative and yielded significant results (Beyond Access, 2012).

10. Model of sustainable ICT services through public libraries

Several writers have written about a sustainable model for ICT for development. Writing from South Africa and India, the authors identify four factors which are crucial for success of ICT4D, namely: understanding community needs, appropriate technology, project implementation strategy and sustainability. On the other hand, Singh and Kumar 2015; and Herselman (2003) have proposed a sustainable model for ICT for development based on the following four components:

1) Education and training of library staff in ICTs
2) Affordable access to ICT technology
3) Information relevant to the users
4) Availability of infrastructure
(Singh, Kumar and Singh, 2015; Herselman, 2003)

Summary

Most of the literature reviewed recognizes the key role of free access to ICTs in the promotion of a knowledge society, particularly for disadvantaged groups in society. Achievement of a knowledge society is essential for a country to join the knowledge and information age and develop, but ICT access is problematic given the challenges of infrastructure and costs (Beyond Access, 2012). The main users are mainly young, male, with relatively higher levels of education, and women are often excluded. Public access ICT services are mainly used for personal and social needs, including communicating with friends, family and entertainment and doing homework (Etta and Parvyn-Wmahiu, 2003).

UNESCO (2005) and World Bank (2005) have championed the creation of knowledge society and knowledge based economy respectively. The two concepts complement each other stressing broad access to information, widening educational opportunities, production of local content, and global and local knowledge sharing (Ponelis and Holmner, 2015). It is generally accepted that African countries lag behind the rest of the world, in access and use of ICTs to achieve development goals in the context of knowledge societies and knowledge based economies.

Many governments in Africa have set up ICT based services, such as E-government, ICT based health services and agriculture information services but use of such services is generally low by the general population who lack ICT literacy, and they attract the more educated groups in society (Kumar and Best, 2006).

To speed up the process of access and use of ICTs, it is essential to build the capacity of community members, NGOs and institutions providing opportunities for free access to the Internet. Quereshi (2014) and other writes have stressed the importance of providing opportunities for ICT and digital literacy training for the general population to raise the

level of ICT literacy in society, particularly among marginalised sections of the population (Haseloff, 2005).

In conclusion, we argue that projects such as *Library for Development* are needed in order to come up with sustainable models for developing countries to provide access to ICT based information services to achieve development goals in the socio-economic and cultural sectors of society.

5. DATA COLLECTION METHODS

The main methods for gathering data were interviews with community and NGO members and library staff members. The instrument used is appended (Appendix 1). Students from the Department of Information and Communication Studies were used in Namibia as research assistants, while students taking a Diploma in Library Science at the SLADS were used in Tanzania for the same purpose. Students were trained on how to administer the instruments for a day in both cases.

At TLSB the same students were used to collect data from library staff that had benefitted from the ICT training. In Namibia the questionnaire was sent to all staff who attended the course as an email with instruction to return after completion (Appendix 2)

Project Annual Reports from both NLAS and TLSB were also scrutinised in order to obtain data on the progress of the project.

Two main data collection problems were encountered. The first one was in Dar es Salaam because of severe traffic jams some respondents could not come for scheduled interviews. In Namibia the email response by library staff on ICT training was lower than expected and reasons for poor response could not be established.

In spite of these shortcomings it is felt that the data gathered is adequate and reliable and provides an accurate picture of the achievements of the project.

6. KEY FINDINGS

Introduction
The section on Key Findings is divided into three parts as follow: Part 1 consists of data gathered from project coordinators and the respective Directors of the two participating National Library Systems i.e. NLAS and TLSB. Part 2 consists of data gathered from community members who obtained training. Part 3 consists of data gathered from interviewing staff members who received ICT training.

PART 1: PROJECT COORDINATORS INTERVIEW DATA AND ANNUAL REPORTS

Namibia Library and Archive Services data for ICT training of library staff, training of community members and training sessions for NGOs are captured in Table 1.

Table 1: Project 2012 – 2014 in Namibia Library and Archives Services (NLAS)

Project Outputs	PLANNED OUTPUT			ACTUAL OUTPUT		
5.1 Library staff trained in ICT skills by Instructors	**Year**	**Total Training**	**Total Participant**	**Year**	**Total Training**	**Total Participant**
	2012	5	17	2012	11	58
	2013	10	30	2013	5	46
	2014	10	30	2014	3	49
	TOTAL	**25**	**77**	**TOTAL**	**19**	**153**
5.2 Training sessions for community members	2012	120	960	2012	122	1322
	2013	120	960	2013	109	1022
	2014	120	960	2014	97	971
	TOTAL	**360**	**2880**	**TOTAL**	**328**	**3315**
5.3 Training sessions for NGOs and other groups	2012	20	250	2012	27	344
	2013	20	250	2013	28	262
	2014	20	250	2014	23	265
	TOTAL	**60**	**750**	**TOTAL**	**78**	**871**

In all cases the data indicate the target was met and actually surpassed. There were two cases the targets were not met - training sessions for community members who had a target 120 each for 2013 and 2014. Instead only 109 and 97 sessions were actually run. However, the numbers of community members who participated were more than those originally targeted (960). The achievement was 1022 participants for 2013 and 971 for 2014. In both cases the total numbers of community members were more than the targeted figure. In terms of the data provided therefore we can conclude that the project was able to achieve the targeted numbers. And in fact went beyond the expectations.

Table 2: Project 2012 – 2014 in Tanzania Library Services Board (TLSB)

Project Outputs	PLANNED OUTPUT			ACTUAL OUTPUT		
5.1 Library staff trained in ICT skills by Instructors	**Year**	**Total Training**	**Total Participants**	**Year**	**Total Training**	**Total Participants**
	2012	5	20	2012	8	47
	2013	10	30	2013	10	33
	2014	10	30	2014	15	83
	TOTAL	**25**	**80**	**TOTAL**	**30**	**163**
5.2 Training sessions for community	2012	2	40	2012	5	27
	2013	10	200	2013	40	558
	2014	12	240	2014	20	488

members	TOTAL	24	480	TOTAL	65	1073
5.3 Training sessions for NGOs and other groups	2012	4	80	2012	9	157
	2013	20	360	2013	29	456
	2014	20	360	2014	20	431
	TOTAL	44	800	TOTAL	58	1044

Similar to their Namibian counterpart, TLSB also appears to have overachieved when it comes to the data supplied by the project coordinator and Directors General Office as the figures are higher than the planned output (Table 2). For example, the target for ICT training for library staff was 80, but 163 were trained; and the target for community members was 480 but by the end of the project 1073 participants had been trained. The target for training sessions for NGOs was 800 participants but the data provided indicate that 1044 participants from this group had been trained between 2012 and 2014. Once again, in terms of numbers the project appears to have met expectations and even slightly surpassed them.

PART 2: COMMUNITY MEMBERS INTERVIEW DATA

Demographic Data

Gender and Age Distribution of Respondents

The study was aimed at women and men who find it difficult to access information through ICTs. The priority was women. The participation in the study shows that Namibia had more women than men (75% and 25% of women and men respectively), Tanzania also had more females than men participating in the evaluation (64% and 36% women and men respectively). The requirements of the project were that at least 50% of the participants would be women. The sample size reflects positively that the targets may have been met although we need to get the absolute figures to see how accurate the sample sizes reflect the actual absolute figures.

One could interpret this pattern to mean the project was successful in targeting women but less successful in targeting men.

Table 3: Age distribution of respondents

Age distribution in years	Tanzania n = 59	Namibia n= 198
16 – 19	7 = 12%	7 = 12%
20 -24	28 = 47%	83 = 42%
25 – 34	7 = 12%	55 = 28%
35 – 49	9 = 15%	37 = 19%
50 – 65	8 = 14%	3 = 2%
Older than 65	0%	0%

The age ranges of participants show that the majority of participants in both countries were young people between 20 and 49 years, at 74% and 89% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively (Table 3). Indeed, for both countries the biggest group was between 20 and 24 years old. The project had an implied target group dominated by young people including the unemployed and those in subsistence farming. The high numbers of youth are therefore according to the plan of the project.

Table 4: Level of formal education completed by respondents

Level of education	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Never attended formal school	0%	0%
Primary education/first stage of basic education	9 = 5%	10 = 17%
Secondary education (high school or equivalent)	155 = 78%	15 = 25%
Post-secondary non-tertiary education (vocational or trade school)	18 = 9%	2 = 3%
Tertiary education (college/university degree) or higher	16 = 8%	32 = 54%

The level of formal education of participants was quite different in the two countries. Whereas in Namibia the majority had secondary school education (78%), in Tanzania the biggest group (54%) had tertiary education. Both countries had no respondents without any education. In the project write up newly literates (first stage of basic education) were expected to part of the target group in both countries. The absolute figures will therefore be compared with sample size to verify the extent this target group was actually reached by project.

The current occupational status of respondents

Table 5: Occupational status of respondents

Employment status	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Self-employed	15 = 8%	18 = 31%
Employed part time	18 = 9%	1 = 2%
Employed full time	21 = 11%	4 = 7%
Unemployed looking for a job	83 = 43%	15 = 25%
Retired	0%	0%
Full-time /Part-time Student	49 = 25%	18 = 31%
Distance-learning Student	6 = 3%	3 = 5%
Housewife/Househusband	1 = 1%	0%
Other	2 = 1%	0%

The occupational status of the participants in Namibia was that the highest percentage (43%) was unemployed looking for a job, followed by full-time and part time students

(25%). In Tanzania, the leading group among participants were the self-employed and full time and part time students (31% each). The group was followed by the unemployed looking for a job (25%). Only a small percentage of respondents were employed full time in both countries (11% and 7% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). A major component of respondents was from the unemployed group or self-employed, and this was in keeping with the requirements of the project. Other data is presented in table 5.

Scope and coverage of the evaluative study

The scope of the project covered two regions in Tanzania, Morogoro (59%) and Dar es Salaam (41%), with the percentage of participants of the evaluation in brackets. In contrast, Namibia's evaluation was more widespread to reflect the broader scope of the project. The names of the regions with participants in brackets were as follow: Erongo (6%), Kavango (5%), Khomas (7%), Omusati (31%), Oshikoto (31%), Zambezi (11%), Otjozondjupa (9%).

The scope of coverage of the evaluation was therefore broader in Namibia then in Tanzania partly reflecting the wider and more active project activities in Namibia.

ICT TRAINING – IMPACT ON YOUR LIFE

One of the objectives of the project was to change the lives of people through the use of ICTs. The study therefore attempted to find out what changes have taken place in the lives of respondents as a result of ICT usage, and respondents were asked how they used computers before taking the training.

Most Namibian respondents had either never used computers before or used computers very little (87%). A small percentage said they used computers every month (6%).

Most respondents in Tanzania also expressed the same sentiments. The highest percentage (87%) had either never used computers before or used them very little. A small percentage said they used computers either once a month or daily (8%).

The project may have therefore served well one of its basic purpose to introduce disadvantaged members of society to the information society through the use of ICTs.

In another question, respondents were asked how they felt now about using computers after the ICT training. Responses are presented in Table 6.

Table 6: Feelings about computers after training

Expressed feelings	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Need more training	98 = 49%	14 =24%
Use with little help	64 = 32%	28 =47%

Use without help	34 = 17%	17 =29%
Other	2 =1%	0%

In both countries, the respondents who said they can use computers without help were fewer (17% and 29% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively) than those who said they needed more training or they could use computers with little help (Table 6). It is possible that the duration of the training was too short for people who were handling computers for the first time in their lives to have developed the necessary confidence hence the request for more training.

Perceived helpfulness of the course

Table 7: How helpful did you find this course

Expressed feelings	**Namibia n=198**	**Tanzania n=59**
Very helpful	163= 82%	37 =63%
Helpful	22 = 11%	18 =31%
Neutral	11 = 6%	4 =7%
Not helpful	1 =1%	0%
Other	1=1%	0%

Respondents were asked to rate how helpful they found the course and their responses are presented in table 7. A much higher percentage of respondents in Namibia found the course helpful than Tanzanian respondents (82% and 63% respectively). Respondents who were neutral were almost the same in the two countries (6% and 7% respectively).

Additional topics respondents like to have seen covered in the course

Respondents were queried on what additional topics they would like to have and their responses are presented in Table 8.

Table 8: Additional topics to be covered

Additional topics respondent would have liked covered in the course	**Namibia n=198**	**Tanzania n=59**
Ms Excel	30 = 15%	5 = 8%
Ms Publisher	8 = 4%	0
Ms Power point	22 = 11%	0
Trouble shooting	3 = 2%	0
Internet	46 = 23%	36 = 61%
Email	19 = 10%	1 = 2%
Typing	31 = 16%	12 = 20%
Other	21 = 11%	17 = 29%

Interestingly, the highest percentage in both countries wanted to have Internet use. For Namibian participants this was followed by Microsoft typing and Ms excel. Likewise, for

Tanzania respondents, the choice of the Internet was followed by Ms Word typing and a range of other topics grouped under other. As the Internet use was an important topic in the course, one can only conclude that participants wanted more time on this topic rather than being introduced to other topics. The Namibian participants had a wider range of topics compared to their Tanzanian counterparts. The difference might be explained by slightly lower skills levels of trainers in Tanzania (see Table 8).

Table 9: What respondents liked most about the course.

Most liked topics/ aspects of the course	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Ms Word	44 = 22%	12 = 20%
Ms Power point	29 = 15%	3 = 5%
Ms Excel	7 = 4%	5 = 8%
Internet	62 = 31%	36 = 61%
Email	32 = 16%	1 = 2%
Facebook	7 = 4%	2 = 3%
Typing	31 = 16%	16 = 27%
Everything liked	0	8 = 14%
Other	8 = 4%	6 = 10%

The study was interested to find out what participants liked most about the course (Table 9). The top choice for both sets of respondents was on how to use the Interne (31% and 61% for Namibia and Tanzania respondents respectively). Typing in Microsoft Word was second choice for both sets of respondent, while email was popular in Namibia (16%) but not in Tanzania (2%).

What respondents liked least about the course.

The question was aimed at finding out the things which were disliked by respondents during the course in order to make improvements in future (Table 10).

Table 10: Lease liked aspects of the course

Least like topics /aspects of course	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Ms Word	11 = 6%	5 = 8%
Ms Power point	7 = 4%	1 = 2%
Ms Excel	3 = 2%	1 = 2%
Internet	12 = 6%	0
Email	10 = 5%	1 = 2%
Facebook	11 = 6%	3 = 5%
Typing	14 = 7%	0
Computers too few	0	7 = 12%
Time was not enough	0	11 = 19%
Everything was good	0	9 = 15%
Trainers not serious	0	4 = 7%
Other	16 = 8%	1 = 2%

The top two least liked aspects for Tanzanian participants were: time was not enough (19%) and computers were too few 12%, while 15% said everything was good. From Namibian participants, the least liked things were to do with the course itself presumably difficulties they had to understand the topics, with MS Word typing (7%) and at 6% each for the following topics – Ms Word, Internet, and Facebook. The interpretation of this response in both countries may indicate that the conditions under which the training was done was not satisfactory in Tanzania hence the to focus on the conditions rather than the course topics, while in Namibia conditions appear to have been more ideal so respondents had more time to focus on the course topics they disliked rather than the conditions under which the ICT training was done.

Additional comments and suggestions by respondents

In an open ended question respondents were asked to give comments and suggestions (Table 11). The responses showed clear contrasts between the two countries. From Namibia, the main concerns were on the need to extend the duration of the ICT course (49%), and to provide a wider range of topics for future courses (28%). Tanzanian participants, however, focussed mainly on the need to improve facilities (more computers are needed 54%; dedicated training room/space was too small 41%); and a need to have trainers with the necessary knowledge, as some of their trainers were perceived not good enough 34%). Once again one can see the responses indicate the facilities were inadequate in Tanzania while in Namibia this appears not a major issue.

Table 11: Additional comments and suggestions

Least like topics /aspects of course	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Extend duration of course	97 = 49%	15 =25%
Reduce topics	2 = 1%	1 = 2%
Increase the topics	56 = 28%	0
Trainer had necessary knowledge	23 = 12%	0
Trainer did not have necessary knowledge	0	20 = 34%
Trainers were friendly/helpful or patient	36 = 18%	1 = 2%
Everything was good	0	1 = 2%
Trainers not serious	0	3 =5%
More computers/printers needed	0	32 = 54%
Dedicated ICT class needed/better training room	0	24 = 41%
Advertise ICT training widely	0	5 = 8%
Can employ myself	0	3 = 5%
Provide free internet services	0	3 = 5%
Other	3 = 2%	5 = 8%

Feelings of respondents on how the training received have changed their IT skills.

The responses of participants as to whether the training they received has changed their IT skills were very positive (Table 12). In both Namibia and Tanzania only a small percentage said their IT skills remained the same (1% and 2 % respectively). The rest of the respondents reported they had either received basic IT skills or said they had improved their IT skills (99%) for both countries. The training thus according to participants' responses has had a major impact in terms of changing IT skills of participants.

Table 12: Feelings after ICT training

Expressed feelings	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
I obtained basic IT skills	98 = 49%	26 = 44%
I have slightly improved my IT skills	55 = 28%	18 = 31%
I have significantly improved my IT skills	43 = 22%	14 = 24%
My IT skills remained the same	2 = 1%	1 = 2%

Another question to respondents was whether the ICT training they received had improved their potential for employment. The majority of respondents in both countries felt strongly that the ICT training had given them a better chance to be employed (76% and 91% for Tanzania and Namibia respectively). A few respondents felt that their chances for employment had not improved (17% and 7% for Tanzania and Namibia respectively). A low number of respondents felt that this was not applicable as they were already employed (7% and 2% for Tanzania and Namibia respectively). The response therefore shows success in this particular objective which has created confidence among respondents that they have improved their chances of employment.

Use of the Internet to look for income related information

Table 13: Internet search for income related information by respondents

Searching for income related information	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Yes, on the Internet through computers in the library	104 = 53%	24 = 41%
Yes, at Internet cafe	11 = 6%	14 = 24%
Yes, with the help of a library staff member	34 = 17%	0
No	44 = 22%	19 = 32%
Not applicable	5 = 3%	2 = 3%

The evaluation also looked into the extent respondents used the internet to look for income related information (Table 13). The responses indicate that the majority of respondents claim to have accessed the internet through computers in the library with slightly more Namibian participant doing so then Tanzanian participants (53% and 41% respectively). On the other hand, there were slightly more Tanzanian participants who claim to have accessed such information through Internet cafes. Only in Namibia did

participant record that they used library staff to search for the Internet for the information. There was a large group of respondents who replied no/not applicable to this question. The data indicates there were no requests for help to library staff by respondents in Tanzania – and this could be explained by some of the infrastructural challenges the project faced in Tanzania.

Starting or improving respondent's small business as a result of this training?

The study wanted to find out what impact the ICT training may have had on the participants in relation to **improving their small business**. The responses indicate that ICT training provided did not have this effect on the majority of respondents (56% and 61% of respondents in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). However, there was a significant percentage who said they had carried out improvements in their small business as result of the ICT training (24% and 27% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). We consider this figure, reasonable and significant given the short span of time of the project. Some respondents however said the question was not applicable to them given that many were learners (21% and 12% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

Improvement of respondents grades through research in the library

The study was also interested to establish whether any of the respondents managed to **improve their grades at school/college/university** through research and information seeking in the library. In both countries respondents who said they had used their library to improve their education grades was higher than those who said either no or not applicable. The respondents, who said yes, were 66% and 71% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively. Respondents who said no were fewer in both countries (23% and 14% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). Respondents, who said not applicable, were few in both countries (11% and 15% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

Table 14: Use of the library to look for educational information

Use of the library to look for education information	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Yes, on the Internet through computers in the library	106 = 54%	32 = 54%
Yes, in printed sources available in the library	25 = 13%	11 = 19%
Yes, with the help of a library staff member	16 = 8%	0
No	39 = 20%	12 = 20%
Not applicable	12 = 6%	4 = 7%

When asked whether they used the library to look for educational information, a slight majority responded that they did so using the Internet through computers in the library (54% for both countries) (Table 14). Printed sources of information were also found useful by a significant percentage of respondents in both countries (13% and 19% for

Tanzania and Namibia respectively). Only 8% of respondents used the help of library staff to search the Internet in Namibia while in Tanzania none among the respondents had used library staff for assistance to search the Internet. Slightly over a quarter of respondents in both countries said the question was not applicable to them or answered that they did not use the library to look for education information. The pattern of low use of library staff in Tanzania by respondents to search the internet for information is once again apparent.

Use the library to seek information about further education

Table 15: Use of the library to seek information on further education

Use of the library to look for education information	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Yes, on the Internet through computers in the library	97 = 49%	32 = 54%
Yes, in printed sources available in the library	38 = 19%	8 = 14%
No	63 = 32%	19 = 32%

The study was also interested to establish whether any of the respondents used the library to seek information for further **education opportunities** (Table 15). In both countries respondents who said they had used their library to further their higher education opportunities were a slight majority at 54% for Tanzania and Namibia respectively. Some respondents used printed sources for both countries (14% and 19% for Tanzania and Namibia respectively. A similar percentage for the two countries is respondents who said they did not use any of the sources (32% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

Respondent starting further education as a result of the information you found at the library

The respondents were asked whether they had started further education, as a result of information they found at the library. Most of the respondents in both countries answered no to this question or said it was not applicable. Overall 73% of participants in Namibia said no, while their Tanzanian counterparts, likewise 57% of the participants said no to this question. On the other hand, respondents who answered yes to this question were slightly more in Tanzania then in Namibia (42% and 27% respectively).

Use of library to look for health information

Table 16: Use of library to look for health information

Use of the library to look for health information	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
Yes, on the Internet through computers in the library	77 = 39%	14 = 24%
Yes, in printed sources available in the	19 = 10%	17 = 29%

library		
Yes, with the help of library staff member	20 = 10%	1 = 2%
No	76 = 38%	26 = 44%
Not Applicable	6 = 3%	1 = 2%

When respondents were asked whether they had used the library to look for health information, the responses were balanced between those who said they had done so and those who did not seek health information through the library. A significant number of respondents in Namibia either said no or not applicable (41%), whereas their Tanzania counterparts who gave a similar response were also quite high (46%). Overall, however, a slight majority of respondents in both countries reported they had used the library resources to seek health information. In Namibia, 39% had used the internet in the library to seek health information, while 10% had used printed sources, but only 10% sought the health information with the help of library staff.

In the case of Tanzanian participants, 24% had used the internet in the library to seek health information, while 29% had used printed sources, but only 2% sought the health information with the help of library staff.

Seeking information about civic rights and e-governance on the internet and apply it

Respondents were asked whether they had sought information on civil rights and e-governance in the Internet and applied it. In both Namibia and Tanzania, there were clear differences on how respondents responded. While in Tanzania, a small majority said Yes (53%), in Namibia, it was the opposite as the majority said No (72%, compared to 14% who said Yes). While in Tanzania only 47% of respondents said no. A slightly smaller group in Namibia did not respond to the question (6%). One of the explanations of this difference might be that during the research there were many political debates going on in Tanzania on constitutional changes and gender equality while in Namibia there were no such hot political debates.

Perceived positive changes in respondent life as a result of attending the training

A key concern of the project was to identify what impact the training has made on the lives of participants. Data on this question is presented in Table 17.

Table 17: Perceived changes in respondent's life

Positive change in the life of respondent	Tanzania	Namibia
I can type documents on my own	**44 =75%**	**134** 68%

I know how to use email now	20 = 34%	38	19%
I can read newspapers online	0	11	6%
I can create quotations & invoices for my business	11 = 19%	5	3%
I can create flyers & posters or business cards for my business	0	4	2%
I can search & apply for jobs online	0	18	9%
I can search for information on the internet	26 = 44%	102	52%
My fear of computers is gone	5 = 8%	0	0
I trained others to use computers	5 = 8%	0	0
I have had no change as I can't practice without computers	6 = 10%	0	0
Other	3 = 5%	3	2%

 In assessing if any changes had occurred, participants were asked to briefly describe the changes they had experienced as a result of attending the training. The described changes show a similar pattern in both countries with Microsoft word typing skills, use of the internet, and use of email topping the list in both countries (Table 17). In Namibia some participants reported being able to read newspapers online (6%), while others said they can apply for jobs online (9%). No respondents in Tanzania reported similar changes. However, some respondents in Tanzania reported different changes, for example, overcoming fear of computers (8%), training others to use computers (8%). Some participants in Tanzania also said there had been no changes in their lives as they had no computers to practice their newly acquired skills (10%)

Importance of your public library to respondents and to the community

One of the goals of the project was to increase perception of the importance of public libraries to community members and their leaders (Table 18). When asked how the importance of their public library has changed over the last 12 months, an overwhelming majority in both countries said their public library had become more important (90% and 82% in Tanzania and Namibia respectively). Only a few respondents said the public library had become less important in Namibia (2%) and none in Tanzania.

Table 18: Perceived changes in the importance of the public library

Perceived changes in importance of public library to you and the community over the past 12 months	Tanzania	Namibia
Became much more important	53 = 90%	163 = 82%
Became slightly more important	5 = 8%	29 = 15%
No change	1 = 2%	2 = 1%

Became slightly less important	0 %	1 = 1%
Became much less important	0%	3 = 2%

ACCESS, SKILLS AND LIBRARY USE

Use the library over the last 12 months

Table 19: Use of the library over the past 12 months

Extent of use of the library over the past 12 months	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
More	102 = 52%	39 = 66%
Less	76 = 38%	13 = 22%
About the same	20 = 10%	7 = 12%

Respondents were asked whether over the past 12 months they had used the library more or less or at the same level (Table 19). A slight majority in both countries said they had used the library more than before (52% and 66% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). However, there was a significant number who reported to have used the library less than before in both countries (38% and 22% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). It is not clear whether such respondents are now using the internet or there are other reasons or it might be the respondents were students who have completed studies and no longer use the library so intensively.

Table 20: Location for first time use of the Internet

Where internet was used for the first time	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
At home	25 = 13%	18 = 31%
At a friend's/neighbours house	18 = 9%	2 = 3%
At work	7 = 4%	3 = 5%
At school	37 = 19%	14 = 24%
At the public/community/library	101 = 51%	11 = 19%
At an Internet café	4 = 2%	9 = 15%
Other	6 = 3%	2 = 3%

The evaluation was interested to find where respondents used internet for the first time (Table 20). The pattern of responses from participants from the two countries differed slightly. Most participants from Namibia used internet for the first time at the public library (51%), followed by a group which used the internet at school (19%) and at home (13%). In contrast, participants from Tanzania, the leading group used internet for the first time from home (31%), followed by those who said they used internet for first time at school (24%) and third was a group who mentioned the public library (19%). Another

group which was significant in Tanzania was those who said they used internet for the first time at an Internet café (15%). The data would seem to indicate that there was already a moderately high level of use of the Internet in the public library in Namibia, while in Tanzania the use of the public library for internet access was quite low.

Table 21: Current access to the Internet

Current location of internet use was use	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
At home	34 = 17%	21 = 36%
At a friend's/neighbours house	9 = 5%	0%
At work	7 = 4%	4 = 7%
At school	16 = 8%	4 = 7%
At the public/community/library	113 = 57%	24 = 41%
At an Internet café	1 = 1%	5 = 8%
Other	18 = 9%	1 = 2%

The evaluation was interested to find out where respondents currently use the internet (Table 21). The pattern of responses from participants from the two countries differed slightly. Most participants from Namibia currently access the internet at the public library (57%), followed by the group which currently use the internet at home (17%) and at school (8%). In contrast, participants from Tanzania, the leading group currently use internet from the public library (41%), followed by those who said they currently use the internet from home (36%) and third was a group who mentioned the Internet café (19%). The data show an increase in the use of internet at the public libraries of both countries and a slight increase in the use of the Internet at home. There was a decrease in the use of the Internet cafes in Tanzania from 15% to 8% by Tanzanian respondents when we compare the data in table 20 and table 21.

When the Internet was used for the first time in the respondent´s life

Table 22: Timing of first time Internet use

When internet was used for the first time	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
6 months ago or less	84 = 42%	8 = 14%
7-11 months ago	19 = 10%	3 = 5%
1-2 years ago	46 = 23%	28 = 47%
3-5 years ago	2 9 = 15%	13 = 22%
More than 5 years ago	20 = 10%	7 = 12%

The participants were asked when they used the Internet for the first time in their lives. The patterns of responses in the two countries were quite different (Table 22)).   In

Namibia a slight majority had used the Internet for the first time in the last 11 months (52%), while only a few of the respondents from Tanzania had learnt use of the Internet in the last 11 months (19%). The biggest group in Tanzania (47%) said they had learnt use of the internet 1-2 years ago. Significantly very few of the respondents had used the Internet 3-5 years ago.

Table 23: Timing of first time Internet use in the library

When internet was used for the first time in the library	Namibia n=198	Tanzania n=59
6 months ago or less	108 = 42%	19 = 32%
7-11 months ago	31 = 16%	3 = 5%
1-2 years ago	40 = 20%	35 = 59%
3-5 years ago	10 = 5%	1 = 2%
More than 5 years ago	9 = 5%	1 = 2%

When participants were asked when they used the Internet in the library for the first time the data was quite interesting (Table 23). The patterns of responses in the two countries were quite different. In Namibia, a slight majority had used the Internet in the library for the first time, in the last 11 months (58%), while only a few of the respondents from Tanzania had used the Internet in library first time in the last 11 months (37%). The biggest group in Tanzania (59%) said they had used the internet in the library from 1-2 years ago. In both cases of respondents, it would seem to indicate the significant role the public library has played in providing access to Internet services for the respondents.

Table 24: Use of the Internet in the library over the past 12 months

Extent of use of the Internet in the library over the past 12 months	Namibian=198	Tanzania n=59
More	97 = 49%	33 = 56%
Less	77 = 39%	20 = 34%
About the same	24 = 12%	6 = 10%

Respondents were asked to reflect on the last 12 months on how much they had used the Internet in the library (Table 24). The responses indicate most of the participants had used the Internet in the library more over the last 12 months (49% and 56% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). However, there was a significantly high number who claimed they had used the Internet in the library less (39% and 34% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). In the case of Namibia, the main explanation of those who said they used the Internet less could be they were students who had completed courses of study while in Tanzania the explanation could include problems of accessing the Internet through the public library as well as students completing studies.

PART 3: TLSB AND NLAS STAFF TRAINING

Introduction
The project had as one of its objectives capacity building of the capacity of NLAS and TLSB library personnel in ICT skills. The evaluation wanted to find out the extent the capacity building was achieved and its contribution to the success of the overall project i.e. training of members of the community and NGOs in ICT skills.

The data was gathered through an interview schedule administered on the staff of the two institutions, both face to face as well as through the use of email. The data collection in Namibia relied mainly on email to staff to respond to the questions and it had a slightly poorer response rate than in the case of Tanzania, where face to face was more predominant.

The training of library staff in the two countries had **more females than males** according to responses. Out of the 49 respondents in Tanzania, 9 (18%) were males, while 40 (82%) were females. In Namibia, the respondents were 2 (15%) males and 11(85%) females.

Table 25: Demographic characteristics of respondents

Factors or variables	Namibia N = 13		Tanzania N = 49	
GENDER		%		%
Female	11	85	40	82
Male	2	15	9	18
AGE				
20-24	0	0	2	4
25-34	9	69	11	22
35 -49	3	23	18	37
50 -65	1	8	18	37
66 and over	0	0	0	0
EDUCATION				
Primary education/basic ed	0	0	5	10
Secondary education	6	46	14	29
Postsecondary/non tertiary	2	15	0	0
Tertiary education	5	38	30	61
PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATION				
Library Certificate	0	0	9	18
Diploma in Library Science	3	23	16	33
Bachelors in Library Science	4	31	2	4
MA in Library Science	0	0	3	6
Other	6	46	19	39

The majority of respondents were young people, particularly in Namibia where 92% were between the age ranges of 25 to 49 years old. The respondents in Tanzania tended to be slightly older and only 59% being in the age range of 25 to 49 years old. Among the 50 to 65 years old were 37% in Tanzania compared to 8% in Namibia.

The data also reveals that the education level of respondents was mainly secondary school education and tertiary level education. In Namibia, for example, 46% and 38% of respondents had secondary and tertiary education respectively. In Tanzania an overwhelming respondents had tertiary level education (61%) followed by those with secondary level education (29%). There were a few respondents in Tanzania who had primary level education (10%) while Namibia had none in this category.

Computers usage before and after ICT training

The evaluation study wanted to find out the extent of use of computers by participants who received ICT training before and after they received training (Table 26) When queried on how much they used computers before training, the majority of respondents said they used computers either daily or at least once every month (77% and 51% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). In Tanzania, however, there were many respondents who said they either used computers very little or had never used computers before (49%), only a few of the Namibian respondents said they had very little use of computers before (23%). None among the Namibian respondents said they had never used a computer.

Table 26: Usage of computers before and after training

Factors or variables	Namibia N = 13		Tanzania N = 49	
USE OF COMPUTERS	Before ICT training (%)	After ICT training (%)	Before ICT training (%)	After ICT training (%)
Never used computers before	0 = 0		6 = 12	
Very little use	3 = 23		18 = 37	
Use every month	2 = 15		5 = 10	
Use Always	8 = 62		20 = 41	
FEELINGS ON USING COMPUTERS AFTER TRAINING				
Need more training		4 = 31		20 = 41
Use with little help		3 = 23		18 = 37
Use without help		5 = 38		11 = 22
Other		1 = 8		0
OVERALL PERCEIVED HELPFULNESS OF THE ICT TRAINING				
Very Helpful		10 = 77		27 = 55
Helpful		2 = 15		21 = 43

Neutral		1 = 8		1 = 2
Not helpful		0 = 0		0 = 2
Other		0 = 0		0 = 2

Respondents were asked to indicate the extent of use of computers before the ICT training course (Table 26). Data collected indicate the majority of respondents used computers daily in Namibia (62%) while the equivalent group in Tanzania was fewer respondents (41%). Among respondents who said they made very little use of computers were slightly lower in both countries (23% and 37% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively). A small group in Tanzania said they had never used computers before (12%) while Namibia had none in this category.

Respondents were asked how they felt with regard to their ICT use competence after ICT training. The data collected however indicated that only a few had gained sufficient confidence to use computers without help (38% and 22% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). The majority of respondents, however, indicated that they could only use computers with little help or needed more training (54% and 78% for Namibia and Tanzania respondents respectively). Given that the Tanzania respondents had some who had never used computers before; it was not surprising that they had more respondents who asked for more training.

ICT Training and impact on respondent's life

Among the impact factors this evaluation was keen to follow up were changes which had taken place among respondents after the ICT training. Respondents were asked whether the ICT training had changed any aspect of their life (Table 27). The majority of respondents said they had either significantly improved their ICT skills or had noted improvement or in basic ICT skills (92% and 100% for Namibia and Tanzania respondents respectively). One respondent in Namibia said ICT skills had remained the same.

An important aim for the ICT training was towards making participants perform better in the various tasks they are doing at the library. When asked whether the ICT training they received had improved their potential to do their work better, there was a resounding yes from the majority of respondents in both countries (92% and 96% from Namibia and Tanzania respectively).

Table 27: Perceived changes after ICT training

Factors or variables	Namibia N = 13		Tanzania N = 49	
CHANGES AFTER ICTTRAINING		%		%
Obtained Basic IT skills	3	23	18	37
Have slightly improved IT skills	2	15	18	37
Significantly improved my IT skills	7	54	13	27

My IT skills remained the the same	1	8	0	0
ICT TRAINING AND POTENTIAL FOR BETTER WORK				
Yes	12	92	47	96
No	0	0	1	2
Not applicable	1	8	1	2
USE INTERNET TO PROVIDE INFORMATION TO USERS				
Yes, through computers in the library	13	100	26	53
Yes, with help of other staff in the library	0	0	5	10
No	0	0	10	20
Not applicable	0	0	8	16

In each country there was one respondent who claimed this was not applicable. Most respondents in both countries also felt the ICT skills received had given them the potential for better work.

Part of the purpose of the ICT training for staff was to provide better information services to users using the Internet as an information and reference source. When respondents were asked whether the ICT training they obtained had led them to use the internet more to provide information to users, many respondents responded that this has actually happened (100% and 63% of respondents from Namibia and Tanzania respectively). In the case of Tanzanian respondents, there were respondents who either said no or not applicable (36%). Part of the explanation for this low rating from Tanzanian respondents could be that some of the library staff who obtained ICT training was working away from library departments which serve users and thus the question was not applicable to them. There is need to review this approach in future to ensure library staff ICT training actually benefits users.

The extent the internet was utilized by respondents after the ICT training course for self-development was another area this study was interested to establish as part of capacity building (Table 28). Many respondents said they had used internet through computers in the library for self-development (92% and 61% for Namibia and Tanzania respectively). The next group are respondents who said they used print sources in the library for self-development, Tanzania leading slightly (37%) followed by Namibia respondents (8%). There were also small numbers among Tanzania respondents who either said no or not applicable (10%).

Table 28: Impact of ICT training on education of respondents

Factors or variables	Namibia N = 13		Tanzania N = 49	
USE OF INTERNET FOR SELF DEVELOPMENT		%		%
Use Internet through computers in the library	12	92	30	61
Use print sources in the library	1	8	18	37
Use internet with help of other library staff member	0	0	3	6
No	0	0	4	8
Not applicable	0	0	1	2
USE OF LIBRARY RESEARCH TO IMPROVE YOUR SCHOOL / ACADEMIC GRADES				
Yes	5	38	28	57
No	5	38	5	10
Not applicable	3	23	16	33
USE OF LIBRARY TO IMPROVE YOUR SCHOOL / ACADEMIC GRADES				
Use Internet through computers in the library	13	100	26	53
Use print sources in the library	0	0	9	18
No	0	0	16	33
START FURTHER EDUCATION AS RESULT OFINFORMATION GOT AFTER ICT TRAINING				
Yes	5	38	15	31
No	5	38	20	41
Not applicable	3	23	14	28

The evaluation study was interested to establish whether respondents had used the library research in the library to improve their academic grades. While in Namibia those who said yes to the question were the same as those who said no (38% each), in Tanzania there were a slightly bigger group who claimed to have improved their academic grades as a result of the ICT training they received (57%), while 43% either said no or not applicable.

Respondents were asked to state whether they managed to improve their academic or school grades through use of the library as a result of the training they received. While all respondents in Namibia claimed they had improved their grades as a result of getting information from the library (100%), the picture from Tanzania was a mixed one. In Tanzania only 53% and 18% of respondents said they had managed to improve their

grades through use of the Internet in the library and print documents respectively.   There was a fairly big group (33%) who said they did not manage to do so.

The study was keen to establish what impact the ICT training has had on the further education ambitions of respondents, mainly through asking respondents to state whether they got information from the Internet as a result of the ICT training which has led to start further education programmes. (Table 28) The results were modest in both Namibia and Tanzania as only 38% and 31% respectively responded in the affirmative. The remaining respondents either said no to the question or said it was not applicable to them.

Respondents were requested to reflect over the past 12 months and whether they had used the internet in the library more than the past or less or same level (Table 29). While in Namibia the overwhelming number said they had used the internet more than the past (85%), in Tanzania figures were more modest but also positive, with 53% of respondents claiming to have used the Internet in the library more than in the past. Tanzania also had the highest percentage who said they had used the Internet less than in the past (38%). The response seemed to indicate there were frequent problems with supply of Internet services through the public library system in Tanzania during the project period.

Table 29: Evaluation of the ICT training

Factors or variables	Namibia N = 13		Tanzania N = 49	
USE OF INTERNET OVER THE PAST 12 MONTHS		%		%
More	11	85	26	53
Less	0	0	18	38
About the same	2	15	5	10
EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL LEVEL OF MATERIALS COVERED IN TRAINING				
Too basic/low	4	31	13	26
Just right	8	62	31	63
Too difficult /too technical	1	8	5	10

The evaluation study wanted to collect data on how respondents found the technical level of materials in the ICT training they received (Table 29). While some respondents found the technical level of materials too basic/low (31% and 26% in Namibia and Tanzania respectively), the majority of respondents found the technical level just right in both Namibia and Tanzania (62% and 63% respectively). A minority of respondents found the technical level too difficult in both countries.

5. Conclusions
As stated, the project was guided by the following four specific objectives:

1)To create a sustainable model for ICT access through community / public libraries and ICT instructors training the library personnel in IT matters and information search in Namibia and Tanzania

2) To build capacity of NLAS and TLSB by training library personnel in ICT skills.

3)To make the library personnel able to teach basic ICT skills and information search to individual customers as well as to members of various NGO´s (e.g. women, entrepreneurs, unemployed and out of school youth, new literates and those needing information on HIV/AIDS and other health issues) both in Namibia and Tanzania.

4) To involve decision makers both in Namibia and Tanzania to raise their awareness of the role of libraries in supporting national development goals.

Objective 1. This project was a pioneering project and in both Namibia and Tanzania the ICT training of community members from disadvantaged groups to participate in the information society has not been attempted before. The data collected and presented here indicate that the major goals were fulfilled.

A sustainable model for ICT access through public libraries, while stronger in Namibia than Tanzania, which started from a lower level of ICT provision, appears to be feasible. The literature review indicates that such a model should have the following basic components:
1) Education and training of library staff in ICTs
2) Affordable access to ICT technology
3) Information relevant to the users
4) Availability of infrastructure
(Singh and Kumar 2015; Herselman 2003)

The four basic components were available in Namibia but needs strengthening in Tanzania to ensure the model of sustainable ICT provision through public libraries becomes comes into existence.

Objective 2. The ICT training of NLAS and TLSB staff was conducted as part of the project and this capacity building was valuable in enabling participants to gain an appreciation of ICTs in the public library and to conduct training for community members and NGO members. The objective was successfully executed, although there were challenges mainly in the Tanzania Library Service Board and the ICT environment in Tanzania which will be addressed in the Recommendations.

Objective 3. The Library staff was able to teach ICT skills to various members of the targeted groups and this was well received by respondents. There were a few complaints

in the case of ICT trainers in Tanzania that some of them were not sufficiently prepared. In the recommendations section we address this issue.

Objective 4. The raising of awareness of the public library for providing access to ICT services among community members and decision makers in both countries appear to have been achieved. However as public officials keep changing as a result of the democratic processes, this would have to be an on-going activity both directly with public officials as well as the mass media.

6. Recommendations

The findings of the evaluation indicate this pioneering project had achieved most of the goals it was set out to achieve, largely due to the dedication of a committed project team in Finland, Namibia and Tanzania. From the responses and document review, we however would like to make the following recommendations for the future.

6.1 General recommendations

1. It was apparent from the responses that community members and NGOs members as well as many of the Library staff have learnt the basics of ICT but they need to develop the necessary confidence for future training programmes. We therefore recommend that more ICT training be provided to both library staff as well as community members on the areas they found they still have some difficulties.

2. The use of the Internet is catching on very well given the short span of time the project has been in existence. We would like to recommend that in order to increase the level of use there is need to work with relevant Government Ministries, NGOs, and International agencies to harvest content and create repositories of the content so that community members and NGOs members can access relevant information. I would recommend use of one of the open source software such as D-Space for the purpose of creating a repository of relevant digital documents with appropriate partners in each country.

3. The project was designed with a strong component of networking with NGO's and relevant stakeholders to strengthen and enrich the range of activities. We would like to recommend that this aspect be strengthened in future by forming a project advisory committee which includes these external stakeholders if they are prepared to work with the NLAS and TLSB to achieve the worthy goals of this project.

4. The capacity building of library staff was an excellent way to prepare them to provide ICT training to community and NGO members. We would like to recommend that in the next round of training a subject of training of trainers be included so staff can acquire basic methodologies on how to train adults.

5. The main Libraries for development project had as its main goal the provision of ICT literacy skills which is a valuable tool for ushering in the knowledge society. We would, however, recommend that NLAS, TLSB and FLA consider expanding this goal to incorporate digital literacy skills so that each year, they would work with volunteers from the local Library Associations and library staff to provide digital literacy training on the use of ICTs including mobile phones for internet searching and digital resources. The broader approach could open the door for broader collaboration with mobile phone operators, Banks, and Ministries of ICTs and Education who might be persuaded to provide more resources for the rolling out of this exciting project.

6.2 Recommendations specific to TLSB

The above general recommendations are aimed at all the three institutions involved in this project. We would like to make specific recommendations in the case of TLSB to address some of the challenges which were specific to their situation with regard to this project.

1. It would seem there were many library staff who were not directly involved with user services who also benefitted from the ICT training. However, such training, valuable as it is, may not have a direct impact on the project outcomes. It is recommended that the ICT training be restricted to library staff serving users directly to achieve project outcomes.

2. The lack of ICT training facilities was one of the challenges community members and NGO members faced during training. We would like to recommend that a dedicated ICT training room be set aside at TLSB and Regional Libraries such as Morogoro Library, for the training of community and NGO members.

3. The shortage of computers at TLSB and free Internet access was a major issue raised during the evaluation, including the problem of frequent power cuts. We recommend, therefore, the possibility of more computers during the 2nd phase and active engagement with relevant Government Ministries in Tanzania on the possibility of providing free Internet access to TLSB.

REFERENCES

Amariles, F., Paz, O. P., Russell, N., & Johnson, N. (2006). The Impacts of Community Telecenters in Rural Colombia. *Journal of Community Informatics, 2*(3).

Arunachalam, (2002). Reaching the Unreached: How Can We Use ICTs to Empower the Rural Poor in the Developing World through Enhanced Access to Relevant Information? International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions General Conference. Glasgow.

Ashraf, M. M., Swatman, P., & Hanisch, D. J. (2007). Some perspectives on understanding the adoption and implementation of ICT interventions in developing countries. *The Journal of Community Informatics, 3*(4).

Bailey, (2009). Issues Affecting the Social Sustainability of Telecentres in Developing Contexts: A Field Study of Sixteen Telecentres in Jamaica. *The Electronic Journal on Information Systems in Developing Countries*. 36(4).

Bertot, J. C., McClure, C. R., & Jaeger, P. T. (2008). The impacts of free public Internet access on public library patrons and communities. *Library Quarterly, 78*(3), 285-301.

Bertot, J. C., McClure, C. R., & Jaeger, P. T. (2008). The impacts of free public Internet access on public library patrons and communities. *Library Quarterly, 78*(3), 285-301.

Bertot, J., McClure, C. R., & Ryan, J. (1999). *Importance of California Public Libraries in increasing public access to the Internet:Final Report*. San Mateo, CA: Peninsula Library System.

Beyond Access (2012). Providing Internet Access Through Public Libraries: An investigation in digital inclision and Twenty First Century skills. Retrived March, 15th 2015 from www.beyondaccess.net

Chisenga, J. (Ed.). (2004). *The Use of ICTs in African Public Libraries. A Survey of Ten Countries in Anglophone Africa*. Oxford: International Network for the Availability of Scientific Publications (INASP).

Creech, H. (2004). *Evaluation of UNESCO's Community Multimedia Centers*: UNESCO Internal Oversight Service; International Institute for Sustainable Development.

Dangwal, R., Jha, S., Chatterjee, S., & Mitra, S. (2005). A Model of How Children Acquire Computing Skills from Hole-in-the-Wall Computers in Public Places. *Information Technologies and International Development, 2*(4), 41-60.

Etta, F., & Parvyn-Wamahiu, S. (2003). *Information and communication technologies for development in Africa: volume 2. The Experience with Community Telecentres.*

Ottowa/Dakar: International Development Research Centre (IDRC) /Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa.

Eve, J. & Brophy, P. 2001. The Value and Impact of IT Access in Public Libraries: Final Report. Library and Information Commission Research Report 102. http://www.cerlim.ac.uk/projects/vital/

Fedotova, E. (2008). E-Skills: Catalyst to Opportunity. *Baltic IT&T Review*, 2008(3).

Gitta, S., & Ikoja-Odongo, J. R. (2003). The Impact of Cybercafés on Information Services in Uganda. *First Monday,8*(4)

Haseloff, A. M. (2005). Cybercafés and their potential as Community Development Tools in India. *Journal of Community Informatics, 1*(3), 53 - 65.

Heeks, R. (2014). Future Priorities for Development Informatics Research fron the Post-2015 Development Agenda. Development Informatics Working Paper Series 57, Centre for Development Informatics, Institute for Development Policy and Management, University of Manchester. Retrieved on March10, 2015 from http://www.seed.manchester.ac.uk/subjects/idpm/research/publications/wp/di/di-wp57/.

Herselman, M. E.(2003). *ICT in Rural Areas in South Africa: various case studies*. In: Informing Science, June.

Holmner, M. and Britz, J.J. (2013). When the last mile becomes the longest mile: a critical reflection on Africas ability to transform itself to become part of the global knowledge society. *Innovation: Journal of appropriate librarianship and information work in Southern Africa*, vol. 46, p.117 - 134

International Telecommunications Union. (2015). *The World in 2014: ICT Facts and Figures.* Retrieved on 16 March, 2015 from http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Documents/facts/ICTFactsFigures2014-e.pdf

Kalusopa, T. (2005). The challenge of utilizing information communication technologies (ICTs) for small-scale farmers in Zambia. *Library Hi Tech*, vol. 23, no 3, p.414-424.

Kiri, K., & Menon, D. (2006). For Profit Rural Kiosks in India: Achievements and Challenges. *Information Technologies for Development*.

Kolko, B. E., Wel, C. Y., and Spyridakis, J. H. (2003). Internet Use in Uzbekistan: Developing a Methodology for Tracking Information Technology Implementation Success. *Information Technologies and International Development, 1*(2), 19. http://www.mitpressjournals.org/doi/abs/ 10.1162/154475203322981932

Kumar, R., & Best, M. (2006b). Social Impact and Diffusion of Telecenter Use: A Study from the Sustainable Access in Rural India Project. *Journal of Community Informatics, 2*(3). http://ci-journal.net/index.php/ciej/issue/view/15

Lengyel, G., Eranusz, E., Füleki, D., Lőrincz, L., & Siklós, V. (2006). The Cserénfa experiment: On the attempt to deploy computers and Internet in a small Hungarian village. *Journal of Community Informatics, 2*(3).

May, J.D. (2012). Digital and Other Poverties: Exploring the Connection in Four East African Countries. *Information Technologies & International Development,* 8(2): 33–50

McClure, C. R., Fraser, B. T., Nelson, T. W., & Robbins, J. B. (2000). *Economic benefits and impacts from public libraries in the state of Florida. Final Report*.

Mercer, C. (2006). Telecentres and transformations: Modernizing Tanzania through the internet. *African Affairs, 105*(419), 243-264.

Pal, J., Nedevschi, S., Patra, R., & Brewer, E. (2005). A Multi-disciplinary Approach to Studying Village Internet Kiosk Initiatives: The Case of Akshaya. *Policy Options and Models for Bridging Digital Divides*. University of Tampere, Finland.

Parkinson, S. (2005). *Telecentres, Access and Development: Experience and Lessons from Uganda and South Africa*. Warwickshire, UK: ITDG/Fountain/IDRC.

Parkinson, S., & Ramírez, R. (2006). Using a sustainable livelihoods approach to assessing the impact of ICTs in development. *Journal of Community Informatics, 2*(3).

Ponelis, S. R. and Holmner, M. A. (2015). ICT in Africa: enabling a better life for all. *Information Technology for Development,* vol 21, no 1, p.1-11.

Proenza, F. (2002). *e-ForAll: A Poverty Reduction Strategy for the Information Age*. Rome: FAO Investment Centre.

Quareshi, S. (2014). Overcoming Technological Determinism in Understanding the Digital Divide: Where do we go from here? *Information Technology for Development,* vol 20, no 3, p.215-217.

Rajalekshmi, K. G. (2007). E-governance services through telecenters: The role of human intermediary and issues of trust. *Information Technologies and International Development, 4*(1), 19-35.

Roman, M. G., Alexis. (2005). *Impact Evaluation of the "Biblioredes Abre tu Mundo" Project.* Retrieved from http://www.biblioredes.cl/NR/rdonlyres/EF066796-154B-4380-B52D-687C080E6B2C/171194/ImpactEvaluationoftheBiblioredesAbretuMundoProject.pdf.

Samarajiva, R. (2007). Telecenters or mobiles? Connecting Sri Lankan families at the bottom of the pyramid. *Journal,* (May 17, 2007). Retrieved from http://www.lbo.lk/fullstory.php?newsID=2086475423&no_view=1&SEARCH_TERM=24

Sey, A (2008) Public Access to ICTs: A review of the literature. University of Washington: Technology and Social Change Group

Sheppard, K. (2001). *The remote community service telecentres of Newfoundland and Labrador, Canada*. Vancouver.

Singh, K. M., Kumar, A. and Singh, R.K.P. (2015) Role of Information Communicaiton Technologies in Indian Agriculture: An overview. Retrieved on March, 15 2015 from http://mpra.ub.uni-muenchem.de/de/62413

UNESCO. (2005). Towards Knowledge Societies. Paris, France: Unesco Publishing
Retrieved on 15 March, 2015 from
http:unescodoc.unesco.org/images0014/001418/14843e.pdf

Ulrich, P. (2004). Poverty Reduction Through Access to Information Communication Technologies in Rural Areas: An analysis of the survey results from the Social Impact Assessment conducted by the Chinese MoST and UNDP: With recommendations on issues of future sustainability and household participation. *The Electronic Journal of Information Systems in Developing Countries*, p. 1-38. Retrieved on 10/03/2015 from http://www.ejisdc.org/ojs2/index.php/ejisdc/article/view/102/102

World Bank. (2009). Knowledge for Development. Retrieved 15 March 2015 from http://go.worldbank.org/94MMDLIVFO.

Appendix 1

TLSB, FINNISH LIBRARY ASSOCIATION AND Namibia Library & Archives Services

Final Evaluation Assessment Survey for Year 1: 2014

DEMOGRAPHIC DATA

1. What is your gender?
   - ☐ Male
   - ☐ Female
2. What is your age?
   - ☐ 16-19
   - ☐ 20-24
   - ☐ 25-34
   - ☐ 35-49
   - ☐ 50-65
   - ☐ Older than 65
3. What is the level of formal education you have completed?
   - ☐ Never attended formal school
   - ☐ Primary education/first stage of basic education
   - ☐ Secondary education (high school or equivalent)
   - ☐ Post-secondary non-tertiary education (vocational or trade school)
   - ☐ Tertiary education (college/university degree) or higher
4. What is your current occupational status?
   - ☐ Self-employed
   - ☐ Employed part time
   - ☐ Employed full time
   - ☐ Unemployed looking for a job
   - ☐ Retired
   - ☐ Full-time /Part-time Student
   - ☐ Distance-learning Student
   - ☐ Housewife/househusband
   - ☐ Other (*please specify*) …………………………………………

5. Which region do you currently live in? …………………………………………………………

6. How did you use computers before taking this training?
    - ☐ Never used a computer before
    - ☐ Very little use
    - ☐ Use every month
    - ☐ Always

7. How do you feel now about using computers after the training?
    - ☐ Need more training
    - ☐ Use with little help
    - ☐ Use without help
    - ☐ Other   (Specify):
      ....
      ......

8. Overall how helpful did you find this course?

    - ☐ Very Helpful

    - ☐ Helpful

    - ☐ Neutral

    - ☐ Not Helpful

9. What additional topics would you like to have seen covered in this course?

    ....
    ....
    ....
    ....

10. What did you like most about this course?

    ....
    ....
11. What did you like least about this course?

    ....
    ....
12. Additional comments or suggestions?

....

....

....

....

....

....

....

....

....

ICT TRAINING – IMPACT ON YOUR LIFE

13. How do you feel the training you received has changed your IT skills?
    ☐ I obtained basic IT skills
    ☐ I have slightly improved my IT skills
    ☐ I have significantly improved my IT skills
    ☐ My IT skills remained the same

14. Do you feel what you learned in the training has improved your potential to be employed?
    ☐ Yes
    ☐ No
    ☐ Not applicable

15. Did you use the internet to look for income related information, such as job announcements, writing a CV, job training, etc.?
    ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library
    ☐ Yes, at Internet cafe
    ☐ Yes, with the help of a library staff member
    ☐ No
    ☐ Not applicable

16. Did you successfully start or improve your small business as a result of this training?
    ☐ Yes
    ☐ No
    ☐ Not applicable

17. Did you use the library to look for information for your current education or learning, such as doing assignments and preparing for exams?
    ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library
    ☐ Yes, in printed resources available in the library
    ☐ Yes, with the help of a library staff member

☐ No

☐ Not applicable

18. Did you manage to improve your grades (school/college/university marks or results) through research in the library?

    ☐ Yes

    ☐ No

    ☐ Not applicable

19. Did you use the library to seek information about further education, for example, getting into a school, a course, a polytechnic, a college or a university?

    ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library

    ☐ Yes, in printed resources available in the library

    ☐ No

20. Did you start the further education (get into a school, course, college, university) as a result of the information you found at the library?

    ☐ Yes

    ☐ No

    ☐ Not applicable

21. Did you use the library to look for health information?

    ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library

    ☐ Yes, in printed resources available in the library

    ☐ Yes, with the help of a library staff member

    ☐ No

    ☐ Not applicable

22. Did you look for information about civic rights and e-governance on the internet and apply it?

    ☐ Yes, I found it on the Internet

    ☐ Yes, looked but didn't find any

    ☐ No

    Type of info you searched for:

    ……

    ……

    …………

23. Could you briefly describe for us the main positive change or changes in your life as a result of attending the training? We want to know in what way or ways your life has improved/changed as a result of the service:

    ……

    ……

    ……

....
....
....
....

We find success stories from users to be very powerful tool to inspire others to use the services and benefit from them. Would you agree to allow us to contact you for more information about the impact of this service? If you do agree, please provide your name and contact information:

Name: ………………………………………………..............

Telephone number: …………………………………….

Email: …………………………………………………………

24. Could you tell how the importance of your public library to you personally and to the community has changed over the last 12 months?

My public library	Became much more important	Became slightly more important	No change	Became slightly less important	Became much less important
For me personally	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
For the community	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐

ACCESS, SKILLS AND LIBRARY USE

25. Thinking back over the last 12 months, did you use the library more than you have in the past, less than you have in the past, or about the same amount?
    - ☐ More
    - ☐ Less
    - ☐ About the same

26. Where did you first use Internet?
    - ☐ At home
    - ☐ At a friend's/neighbor's house
    - ☐ At work
    - ☐ At school
    - ☐ At the public/community library
    - ☐ At an Internet café
    - ☐ Other (*please specify*)………………………………….

27. Where do you currently use the Internet?
    - ☐ At home

- ☐ At a friend's/neighbor's house
- ☐ At work
- ☐ At school
- ☐ At the public/community library
- ☐ At an Internet café
- ☐ Other (*please specify*)…………………………………….

28. When did you first use the Internet (the first time in your life)?
- ☐ 6 months ago or less
- ☐ 7-11 months ago
- ☐ 1-2 years ago
- ☐ 3-5 years ago
- ☐ More than 5 years ago

29. When did you first use the Internet in the library?
- ☐ 6 months ago or less
- ☐ 7-11 months ago
- ☐ 1-2 years ago
- ☐ 3-5 years ago
- ☐ More than 5 years ago

30. Thinking back over the last 12 months, did you use the Internet in the library more than you have in the past, less than you have in the past, or about the same amount?
- ☐ More
- ☐ Less
- ☐ About the same

TLSB, FINNISH LIBRARY ASSOCIATION AND Namibia Library & Archives Services

Staff Training

Final Evaluation Assessment Survey for Year: 2014

DEMOGRAPHIC DATA

---

31. What is your gender?
- ☐ Male
- ☐ Female

32. What is your age?
- ☐ 16-19
- ☐ 20-24
- ☐ 25-34
- ☐ 35-49
- ☐ 50-65
- ☐ Older than 65

33. What is the level of formal education you have completed?
- ☐ Primary education/first stage of basic education
- ☐ Secondary education (high school or equivalent)
- ☐ Post-secondary non-tertiary education (vocational or trade school)
- ☐ Tertiary education (college/university degree) or higher

34. What is your current section of employment in the TLSB ?

_____

35. What is your highest professional qualification?

COMPUTER USAGE BEFORE AND AFTER TRAINING

---

36. How did you use computers before taking this training?
- ☐ Never used a computer before

☐ Very little use
☐ Use every month
☐ Always

37. How do you feel now about using computers after the training?
☐ Need more training
☐ Use with little help
☐ Use without help
☐ Other   (Specify):
………
…...

38. Overall how helpful did you find this course?

☐ Very Helpful

☐ Helpful

☐ Neutral

☐ Not Helpful

39. What additional topics would you like to have seen covered in this course?

……
……
……
……………………………

40. What did you like most about this course?

……
………………………………………………………………

41. What did you like least about this course?

……
………………………………………………………………

42. Additional comments or suggestions?

……
……
……
………
………
………
………
………
………………………………………………………………

43. How do you feel the training you received has changed your IT skills?
  ☐ I obtained basic IT skills
  ☐ I have slightly improved my IT skills
  ☐ I have significantly improved my IT skills
  ☐ My IT skills remained the same

44. Do you feel what you learned in the training has improved your potential to do your work better?
  ☐ Yes
  ☐ No
  ☐ Not applicable

45. Did you use the internet to look for information requested by library users?
  ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library
  ☐ Yes, with the help of other library staff members
  ☐ No
  ☐ Not applicable

46. Did you use the library to look for information for your own self development?
  ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library
  ☐ Yes, in printed resources available in the library
  ☐ Yes, with the help of other library staff members
  ☐ No
  ☐ Not applicable

47. Did you manage to improve your grades (school/college/university marks or results) through research in the library?
  ☐ Yes
  ☐ No
  ☐ Not applicable

48. Did you use the library to seek information about further education, for example, getting into a school, a course, a polytechnic, a college or a university?
  ☐ Yes, on the Internet through computers available in the library
  ☐ Yes, in printed resources available in the library
  ☐ No

49. Did you start any further education (get into a school, course, college, university) as a result of the information you found at the Internet after the ICT training?
  ☐ Yes
  ☐ No

☐ Not applicable

....

50. Could you briefly describe for us the main positive change or changes in your work as a result of attending the training? We want to know in what way or ways your life has improved/changed as a result of the service:

....
....
....
....
....
....
....

51. Could you tell us how your awareness of the importance of ICTs for the public library has changed over the last 12 months?

....---

----

52. Thinking back over the last 12 months, did you use the Internet in the library more than you have in the past, less than you have in the past, or about the same amount?

☐ More
☐ Less
☐ About the same

Please reflect on the training that you just completed and respond to the following:

1. What part of the training was the **most useful** for your work?

2. What part of the training was the **least useful** for your work?

3. Please list three ideas or lessons that you learned during this training that you took back to your worksite/practice.

a.

b.

c.

4. What information/topics should be added to this training?

5. The technical level of the material covered in the workshop was: (<u>circle one</u>)

    Too basic/low   Just right   Too difficult/too technical

6. How could the course be improved?

7. Other comments:

Thank you for completing this form!